

157

**MINUTES OF THE 140<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE  
INSTITUTE BODY HELD ON THURSDAY, THE 17<sup>TH</sup>  
JULY, 2008 AT 5.00 P.M. IN THE MINISTRY OF  
HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE, NIRMAN BHAWAN,  
NEW DELHI.**

\*\*\*\*\*

The following attended the meetings:-

- 1) Dr. Anbumani Ramadoss,  
Union Minister of Health & Family Welfare,  
Nirman Bhawan,  
NEW DELHI – 110 011 -- President
- 2) Shri R.K. Dhawan,  
Member of Parliament (Rajya Sabha),  
141, Golf Links,  
NEW DELHI – 110 003. -- Member
- 3) Dr. Karan Singh Yadav,  
Member of Parliament (Lok Sabha)  
C-6, M.P. Flats,  
Baba Khadak Singh Marg,  
NEW DELHI – 110 001 -- Member
- 4) Shri Naresh Dayal,  
Secretary to the Govt. of India,  
Ministry of Health & Family Welfare,  
Nirman Bhawan,  
NEW DELHI – 110 011 -- Member
- 5) Shri R.P. Agarwal,  
Secretary to the Govt. of India,  
Deptt. of Secondary & Higher Education,  
Ministry of Human Resource Development,  
Shastri Bhawan,  
NEW DELHI – 110 001 -- Member
- 6) Dr. R.K. Srivastava,  
Director General of Health Services,  
Nirman Bhawan,  
NEW DELHI – 110 011 -- Member
- 7) Shri Naved Masood,  
Addl. Secretary & Financial Adviser,  
Government of India,  
Ministry of Health & Family Welfare,  
Nirman Bhawan,  
NEW DELHI – 110 011 -- Member

- 8) Dr. K.M. Shyama Prasad,  
Vice-President,  
National Board of Examination,  
Ansari Nagar,  
NEW DELHI-110 029 -- Member
- 9) Prof. Kartar Singh,  
Head of the Deptt. of Gastroenterology,  
Post Graduate Institute of Medical  
Education & Research,  
CHANDIGARH. -- Member
- 10) Prof. R. Surendran  
Professor & Head,  
Deptt. of Surgical Gastroenterology,  
Government Stanley Hospital,  
CHENNAI -- Member
- 11) Dr. T.D. Dogra,  
Director,  
A.I.I.M.S., Ansari Nagar,  
NEW DELHI - 110 029 -- Member-Secretary
- 12) Mrs. Shalini Prasad,  
Jt. Secretary to the Govt. of India,  
Ministry of Health & Family Welfare,  
Nirman Bhawan,  
NEW DELHI-110 011 -- Special Invitee

Shri Shailesh Kumar Yadav, Dy. Director (Admn.), AIIMS and Dr. D.N. Pathak, CCA and Sr. Financial Adviser (Actg.), AIIMS also attended the meeting.

Prof. Vijay Kumar Malhotra, Member of Parliament (Lok Sabha); Dr. Deepak Pental, Vice-Chancellor, Delhi University; Dr. S.S. Agarwal, Lucknow, Member, IB; Prof. B.P. Chatterjee, Kolkata, Member, IB; Prof. K.K. Talwar, Director, PGIMER, Chandigarh; Dr. (Mrs.) Nilima Arun Kshirsagar, Mumbai, Member, IB and Dr. R.C. Deka, Dean (Academic), AIIMS, New Delhi could not attend the meeting.

The Director welcomed the Hon'ble President and the respected members to the meeting of the Institute Body and with the permission of the Chair took up the agenda items for deliberation.

Item No.IB/1 **CONFIRMATION OF THE MINUTES OF THE INSTITUTE BODY MEETING HELD ON 20.12.2007 IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE, NIRMAN BHAWAN, NEW DELHI.**

---

The Director informed the members that no comments or objections were received from the members of the Institute in this regard.

Shri R.K. Dhawan pointed out on action taken on agenda item No.IB/2 relating to the issue of proper functioning of the Institute vis-a-vis powers of the Chiefs of Centres and other administrative matters at the Institute. As regards the report of the AS/FA, as discussed in the last meeting of the Institute Body held on 20.12.2007, Shri Naved Masood,AS/FA informed that comments from various faculty members of the Institute have been received and the former Director was requested to give convenient time so that the report & comments could be deliberated upon. But he did not respond for the same. However, Dr. T.D. Dogra has since taken over as Acting Director, he will have meeting with him and finalise the report.

The Minutes were confirmed.

Item No.IB/2 **ACTION TAKEN ON THE MINUTES OF THE INSTITUTE BODY MEETING HELD ON 20.12.2007 IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE, NIRMAN BHAWAN, NEW DELHI.**

---

On the Action Taken against Item No. IB/3, Shri R.P. Agarwal expressed his happiness over setting up of coaching centre for SC/ST students and other remedial actions as per recommendations of Thorat Committee. He informed that IIT has a kind of 2-tier Coaching Centre. This system of coaching was for those students who are slightly deficient and those significantly below average. This was a preparatory coaching and is given after the selection in order to enable such students to come at par with their fellow students. He emphasized that this type of coaching system should be evolved in the Institute also to train those who are slightly deficient or below average as otherwise such students would not be able to move with the class.

4

152

Dr. Shyama Prasad opined that such students were not backward, but, they needed help in terms of language. He pointed out that the most important thing was the language problem with such students and they should not be discriminated. The President advocated the transparent system of selection and suggested that extra hours should be put in for coaching like evening coaching or week-end coaching and it should not be a forced coaching rather it should be optional. He also suggested that the AIIMS should follow the selection process as was in vogue in Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore. He shared his experience of such a system that photocopy of the answer-sheet is given to the students and a copy of corrected answers is displayed enabling the students to tally their answers. The result is also put on the website the very next day. He was confident that such a system, in turn, would prevent any malfunctioning in an Institution.

The Action taken were, however, noted.

Item No. IB/3 **TO CONSIDER THE ACTION TAKEN ON THE MINUTES OF THE GOVERNING BODY MEETINGS HELD ON 24.01.2007, 07.05.2007 AND 05.09.2007 IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE, NIRMAN BHAWAN, NEW DELHI.**

---

Shri R.K. Dhawan pointed out the issue of grant of prosecution sanction to the CBI in respect of Dr. N.K. Mehra which was not brought before the Governing Body. He desired that this item should be brought before the Governing Body and the decision should be implemented otherwise it would amount to departure from the decision of the Governing Body.

The Health Secretary informed that he was authorized to examine the issue and he had already submitted his report and that there was a fixed time limit for giving sanction. He, however, briefed that there was no ground for not giving prosecution sanction to the CBI in respect of Dr. N.K. Mehra. Shri Dhawan expressed concern about the involvement of such a senior level faculty of AIIMS in such a scam of embezzlement of funds. Shri Dhawan also pointed out that there were 6-7 issues pending for disposal in the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare since June, 2007 and desired that such issues should be expedited. The President advised the Secretary (Health) to ensure disposal of the same.

Item No. IB/4 **TO CONSIDER THE SELECTION PROCEDURE, RECRUITMENT RULES AND SELECTION-CUM-SEARCH COMMITTEE FOR APPOINTMENT TO THE POST OF DIRECTOR, AIIMS, NEW DELHI.**

---

Before the item could be deliberated upon, the Director sought permission from the Chair to leave the meeting since he is a candidate for the post of Director. The gesture of the Director was commended by the members and he was allowed to leave the meeting by the Chair and Dr. Kartar Singh also followed suit with the permission of the Chair as he is also a candidate for the post of Director. During the short absence of the Director, Sh. Shailesh Kumar Yadav, Dy. Director (Admn.) was authorized to act as Member-Secretary of the Institute Body

Sh. Shailesh Kumar Yadav informed that in the last meeting of the Institute Body held on 20<sup>th</sup> December, 2007, it was decided that the Dy. Director (Admn.) of the Institute may call for application for the post of Director. Accordingly, applications were called by circulation and by advertisement. Before doing so, clarification was sought from the Ministry regarding upper age limit and tenure of the post. He also informed that in the last selection of the Director, there was no mention about the tenure while this time there was a mention about the fixed time frame of tenure. He further informed that a total of 69 applications have been received and the same were required to be placed before the Search-cum-selection Committee.

The President desired to know whether all the 69 applicants were eligible to be considered. The Dy. Director (Admn.) informed that he was not authorized to screen the applications.

Shri R.P. Agarwal and Dr. Karan Singh Yadav pointed out about the Clause of UPPER AGE LIMIT and wanted to know what was meant by specially qualified candidates, direct recruits and promotees as the same was ambiguous. The Dy. Director (Admn.) informed that in the Institute there were two modes of appointment to the post of Professor viz. (i) direct recruitment and (ii) promotion under Assessment Promotion Scheme.

Shri R.K. Dhawan wanted to know as to with whose authority the qualification/criteria was fixed. The Dy. Director (Admn.) informed that the qualification/criteria was decided by the Institute Body way back and no changes

were made by the existing Institute Body. The only changes made, were upper age limit and the tenure of service. Sh. R.P. Agarwal suggested that there should be some lower limit of age of the candidates to be considered for appointment.

Dr. Shyama Prasad informed that if the age limit was one of the conditions in the advertisement, nothing could be done at this stage and emphasized that the Institute has to follow the advertisement otherwise legal complications would emerge out of the same. The opinion expressed by Dr. Shyama Prasad was supported by Sh. R.P. Agarwal. However, Dr. Karan Singh Yadav and Secretary (Health) were of the view that upper age limit may be enhanced to 62 years. Finally, the upper age limit as 60 years for the post of Director, AIIMS as already advertised/circulated, was approved.

Shri Dhawan pointed out that there was some recommendations from the PMO as regard to constitution of Search-cum- Selection Committee and wanted to know how the PMO has interfered in the affairs of the Institute Body since there was no mention about the PMO in the AIIMS Act, the Rules and the Regulations. Dr. Shyam Prasad seconded the opinion of Sh. Dhawan. The Health Secretary informed that the PMO had made its recommendations and it was well within the domain of the Institute Body to accept such recommendations or decide otherwise. He also informed that a constitution of Search-cum-Selection Committee consisting of the following members was recommended for the purpose:

- |    |   |    |                  |
|----|---|----|------------------|
| 1) | President, AIIMS  | -- | Chairman         |
| 2) | Director General of Health Services<br>M/o H&FW             | -- | Member           |
| 3) | DG-cum-Secretary,<br>Deptt. of Medical Research<br>M/o H&FW | -- | Member           |
| 4) | Vice Chancellor of Delhi University                         | -- | Member           |
| 5) | Four nominees of I.B.                                       | -- | Member           |
| 6) | Secretary(H&FW)<br>M/o Health & Family Welfare,             | -- | Member-Secretary |

The Health Secretary informed that since there was no Director General-cum-Secretary, Deptt. of Medical Research, he himself is looking after the additional charge of this post. The Health Secretary also brought to the notice of IB that the PMO has further recommended the following 3 eminent members to be included in the Search-cum-Selection Committee:-

- 1) Principal Scientific Adviser to the Prime Minister
- 2) Director General, Council of Scientific & Industrial Research
- 3) Director General, Railway Health Services

The members opined that although the PMO has suggested eminent personalities in the committee, but there should be broader committee for the said purpose.

The members considered the names of various eminent personalities in the country for inclusion in the Search-cum-Selection Committee and unanimously decided that apart from the above recommendations from the PMO, few more personalities be included in the Search-cum-Selection Committee.

In the meantime, the Dy. Director (Admn.) informed the members that two members of aforesaid Search-cum-Selection Committee, viz Dr. (Mrs.) Nilima Arun Kshirsagar and Prof. Deepak Pental, Vice Chancellor, Delhi University cannot be the members of the Search-cum-Selection Committee since they have nominated the candidates and as per I.B. decision their participation in the committee was not permissible.

The Institute Body unanimously approved the Search-cum-Selection Committee consisting of the following members:-

- |    |   |    |          |
|----|---|----|----------|
| 1) | President, AIIMS  | -- | Chairman |
| 2) | Director General of Health Services                                     | -- | Member   |
| 3) | Dr. R. Chidambaram,<br>Principal Scientific Adviser to PM               | -- | Member   |
| 4) | Prof. Samir K. Brahmachari,<br>Director General, CSIR                   | -- | Member   |
| 5) | Dr. V.K. Ramteke<br>Director General, Railway Health Services.          | -- | Member   |
| 6) | Shri R.P. Agarwal, Secretary,<br>Deptt. of Secondary & Higher Education | -- | Member   |
| 7) | Prof. N.K. Ganguli,<br>Ex-Director General of ICMR.                     | -- | Member   |

- |     |  |    |                  |
|-----|--|----|------------------|
| 8)  | Prof. Sukhdev Thorat,<br>Chairman, UGC.  | -- | Member           |
| 9)  | Prof. R. Surendran,<br>Govt. Stanley Hospital, Chennai                         | -- | Member           |
| 10) | Dr. Shyam Prasad,<br>Vice-President, NBE, New Delhi                            | -- | Member           |
| 11) | Shri Naresh Dayal,<br>Secretary,<br>M/o Health & Family Welfare,<br>New Delhi. | -- | Member-Secretary |

Shri R.K. Dhawan was of the opinion that the Search-cum-Selection Committee should not focus on one name as once it recommends one name for appointment, the Institute Body was bound to go by the recommendation of the committee. Instead, he suggested that, the Search-cum-Selection Committee should make a panel of names for wider choice so that the Institute Body might not be bound to approve the only name recommended by the Search-cum-Selection Committee. He also suggested that the panel of names to be so recommended by the Search-cum-Selection Committee should be without mentioning any priority. The opinion expressed by Shri R.K. Dhawan was supported by the members of the Institute Body.

It was decided that the Search-cum-Selection Committee may make a panel of at least two candidates without mentioning their order of merit, for approval of the Institute Body. The Institute Body further decided that the Search-cum-Selection Committee may expedite the selection process. It was also decided to hold the first meeting of the Search-cum-Selection Committee on 31.07.2008.

**Any Other Items with the permission of the Chair**

The Director, AIIMS and Dr. Kartar Singh, Member was called in to attend the meeting.

- 1) Shri R.K. Dhawan wanted to know about the allotment of C-II type accommodation to the Medical Superintendent as decided in the last Governing Body meeting. He desired that one C-I type accommodation may be permanently earmarked to the Medical Superintendent if C-II Ground Floor accommodation is not available. He also wanted to know the reasons behind not getting the



accommodation vacated by those faculty members who retired from the service as early as in February, 2008. The Director informed that process to earmark accommodation to the Medical Superintendent would be accomplished soon. Sh. Dhawan also desired that the issue regarding financial powers to the Chiefs of Centres and other administrative matters be also expedited.

- 2) The President desired that work on "Maternity and Child Health Care" block should be started immediately since it is a very crucial service and mere 36 beds for the service as existing in AIIMS, would not serve the purpose.
- 3) Participating in the debate, Shri R.P. Agarwal shared his experience and pointed out that in AIIMS, for each routine investigations like urine test, blood tests etc, Rs.100/- was being charged for which the general public was made to stand in the queue for hours together. Shri R.P. Agarwal suggested that for the indoor patients, such investigation charges may be added to their bill and they could be asked to deposit the same at the time of their discharge from the hospital. Dr. R. Surendran suggested that in the first instance, the samples should be accepted by the Institute without asking for the charges and later, at the time of collection of the reports of all such investigation, they may be asked to produce the receipts of having deposited the charges. He opined that in that way the general public would get relief from standing in queue for hours together and they could deposit the charges on any day before collection of investigation reports as it take at least 3-4 days time for collection of investigation report.

The President desired that this system should be changed and user friendly proposal be taken up in the next Governing Body meeting.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.



A handwritten signature in black ink, followed by a horizontal line and the date "24/7/08".